

# On semigroups of nonnegative functions and positive operators

Roman Drnovšek

University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

Positivity VII, Leiden, July 2013

Joint work with Heydar Radjavi (Univ. of Waterloo, Canada).

# Entry-wise boundedness

Given a set  $K \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ , we write  $M_n(K)$  for the set of all  $n \times n$  matrices with entries in  $K$ .

Theorem (Gessesse, Popov, Radjavi, Spinu, Tcaciuc, Troitsky)

*Let  $r > 1$  and  $\mathcal{S}$  be a (multiplicative) semigroup in  $M_n([0, r])$ . Then there exists a diagonal matrix  $D = \text{diag}(d_1, \dots, d_n)$  with  $d_i \in [\frac{1}{r}, r]$  such that  $D^{-1} \mathcal{S} D \subseteq M_n([0, 1])$ .*

# Entry-wise boundedness

Given a set  $K \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ , we write  $M_n(K)$  for the set of all  $n \times n$  matrices with entries in  $K$ .

**Theorem (Gessesse, Popov, Radjavi, Spinu, Tcaciuc, Troitsky)**

*Let  $r > 1$  and  $\mathcal{S}$  be a (multiplicative) semigroup in  $M_n([0, r])$ . Then there exists a diagonal matrix  $D = \text{diag}(d_1, \dots, d_n)$  with  $d_i \in [\frac{1}{r}, r]$  such that  $D^{-1} \mathcal{S} D \subseteq M_n([0, 1])$ .*

A set  $\mathcal{S}$  of nonnegative functions on  $X \times X$ , closed under a given associative operation  $*$ , is called a *matrix-like semigroup* if

$$(f * g)(x, z) \geq f(x, y) g(y, z)$$

for all  $f, g \in \mathcal{S}$  and  $x, y, z \in X$ .

### Theorem

Let  $M \geq 1$  be a real number and let  $\mathcal{S}$  be a matrix-like semigroup of functions from  $X \times X$  to  $[0, M]$ . Then there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto [\frac{1}{M}, M]$  such that

$$f(x, y) \leq \frac{d(x)}{d(y)}$$

for all  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  and  $x, y \in X$ .

A set  $\mathcal{S}$  of nonnegative functions on  $X \times X$ , closed under a given associative operation  $*$ , is called a *matrix-like semigroup* if

$$(f * g)(x, z) \geq f(x, y) g(y, z)$$

for all  $f, g \in \mathcal{S}$  and  $x, y, z \in X$ .

### Theorem

Let  $M \geq 1$  be a real number and let  $\mathcal{S}$  be a matrix-like semigroup of functions from  $X \times X$  to  $[0, M]$ . Then there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto [\frac{1}{M}, M]$  such that

$$f(x, y) \leq \frac{d(x)}{d(y)}$$

for all  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  and  $x, y \in X$ .

## Theorem

Let  $X$  be an arbitrary set, and let  $f : X \times X \mapsto [0, \infty)$  be a function such that

$$C_f(x, y) = \sup \{ f(x, x_1) f(x_1, x_2) f(x_2, x_3) \cdots f(x_k, y) :$$

$$k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\}, x_1, \dots, x_k \in X \} < \infty$$

for all  $x$  and  $y$  in  $X$ .

(a) If there is a point  $y_0 \in X$  such that  $C_f(x, y_0) > 0$  for all  $x \in X$ , then there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto (0, \infty)$  such that

$$f(x, y) \leq C_f(x, y) \leq \frac{d(x)}{d(y)} \quad (1)$$

for all  $x$  and  $y$  in  $X$ .

(b) If there is a constant  $M \geq 1$  such that  $C_f(x, y) \leq M$  for all  $x$  and  $y$  in  $X$ , then there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto [\frac{1}{M}, M]$  such that (1) holds.

## Theorem

Let  $X$  be an arbitrary set, and let  $f : X \times X \mapsto [0, \infty)$  be a function such that

$$C_f(x, y) = \sup \{ f(x, x_1) f(x_1, x_2) f(x_2, x_3) \cdots f(x_k, y) : \\ k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\}, x_1, \dots, x_k \in X \} < \infty$$

for all  $x$  and  $y$  in  $X$ .

(a) If there is a point  $y_0 \in X$  such that  $C_f(x, y_0) > 0$  for all  $x \in X$ , then there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto (0, \infty)$  such that

$$f(x, y) \leq C_f(x, y) \leq \frac{d(x)}{d(y)} \quad (1)$$

for all  $x$  and  $y$  in  $X$ .

(b) If there is a constant  $M \geq 1$  such that  $C_f(x, y) \leq M$  for all  $x$  and  $y$  in  $X$ , then there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto [\frac{1}{M}, M]$  such that (1) holds.

## Theorem

Let  $X$  be an arbitrary set, and let  $f : X \times X \mapsto [0, \infty)$  be a function such that

$$C_f(x, y) = \sup \{ f(x, x_1) f(x_1, x_2) f(x_2, x_3) \cdots f(x_k, y) :$$

$$k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\}, x_1, \dots, x_k \in X \} < \infty$$

for all  $x$  and  $y$  in  $X$ .

(a) If there is a point  $y_0 \in X$  such that  $C_f(x, y_0) > 0$  for all  $x \in X$ , then there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto (0, \infty)$  such that

$$f(x, y) \leq C_f(x, y) \leq \frac{d(x)}{d(y)} \quad (1)$$

for all  $x$  and  $y$  in  $X$ .

(b) If there is a constant  $M \geq 1$  such that  $C_f(x, y) \leq M$  for all  $x$  and  $y$  in  $X$ , then there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto [\frac{1}{M}, M]$  such that (1) holds.



A semigroup  $\mathcal{S} \subset M_n([0, \infty))$  is said to be *indecomposable* (or *irreducible*) if, for every  $i, j$  in  $\{1, \dots, n\}$ , there exists  $S \in \mathcal{S}$  with  $S_{ij} > 0$ . Equivalently: No permutation of the standard basis reduces the semigroup  $\mathcal{S}$  to the block form

$$\begin{bmatrix} * & * \\ 0 & * \end{bmatrix}.$$

Or equivalently:  $\mathcal{S}$  has no common non-trivial proper invariant ideals (i.e., subspaces spanned by a subset of the standard basis).

A semigroup  $\mathcal{S} \subset M_n([0, \infty))$  is said to be *indecomposable* (or *irreducible*) if, for every  $i, j$  in  $\{1, \dots, n\}$ , there exists  $S \in \mathcal{S}$  with  $S_{ij} > 0$ . Equivalently: No permutation of the standard basis reduces the semigroup  $\mathcal{S}$  to the block form

$$\begin{bmatrix} * & * \\ 0 & * \end{bmatrix}.$$

Or equivalently:  $\mathcal{S}$  has no common non-trivial proper invariant ideals (i.e., subspaces spanned by a subset of the standard basis).

A semigroup  $\mathcal{S} \subset M_n([0, \infty))$  is said to be *indecomposable* (or *irreducible*) if, for every  $i, j$  in  $\{1, \dots, n\}$ , there exists  $S \in \mathcal{S}$  with  $S_{ij} > 0$ . Equivalently: No permutation of the standard basis reduces the semigroup  $\mathcal{S}$  to the block form

$$\begin{bmatrix} * & * \\ 0 & * \end{bmatrix}.$$

Or equivalently:  $\mathcal{S}$  has no common non-trivial proper invariant ideals (i.e., subspaces spanned by a subset of the standard basis).

**Theorem (Gessesse, Popov, Radjavi, Spinu, Tcaciuc, Troitsky)**

*Let  $\mathcal{S}$  be an indecomposable semigroup in  $M_n([0, \infty))$  such that the set  $\{S_{ij} : S \in \mathcal{S}\}$  is bounded for some pair  $(i, j)$ . Then there exists a diagonal matrix  $D$  with positive diagonal entries such that  $D^{-1}\mathcal{S}D \subseteq M_n([0, 1])$ .*

The indecomposability assumption cannot be omitted:

$$\mathcal{S} = \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1 & r \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} : r \in [0, \infty) \right\}.$$

**Theorem (Gessesse, Popov, Radjavi, Spinu, Tcaciuc, Troitsky)**

*Let  $\mathcal{S}$  be an indecomposable semigroup in  $M_n([0, \infty))$  such that the set  $\{S_{ij} : S \in \mathcal{S}\}$  is bounded for some pair  $(i, j)$ . Then there exists a diagonal matrix  $D$  with positive diagonal entries such that  $D^{-1}\mathcal{S}D \subseteq M_n([0, 1])$ .*

The indecomposability assumption cannot be omitted:

$$\mathcal{S} = \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1 & r \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} : r \in [0, \infty) \right\}.$$

A set  $\mathcal{S}$  of nonnegative functions on  $X \times X$  is *indecomposable* if, for every  $x, y \in X$ , there exists  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  such that  $f(x, y) > 0$ .

### Theorem

*Let  $\mathcal{S}$  be an indecomposable matrix-like semigroup of nonnegative functions on  $X \times X$ . If there exist  $u, v \in X$  such that*

$$\sup\{f(u, v) : f \in \mathcal{S}\} < \infty,$$

*then there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto (0, \infty)$  such that*

$$f(x, y) \leq \frac{d(x)}{d(y)}$$

*for all  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  and  $x, y \in X$ .*

A set  $\mathcal{S}$  of nonnegative functions on  $X \times X$  is *indecomposable* if, for every  $x, y \in X$ , there exists  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  such that  $f(x, y) > 0$ .

## Theorem

*Let  $\mathcal{S}$  be an indecomposable matrix-like semigroup of nonnegative functions on  $X \times X$ . If there exist  $u, v \in X$  such that*

$$\sup\{f(u, v) : f \in \mathcal{S}\} < \infty,$$

*then there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto (0, \infty)$  such that*

$$f(x, y) \leq \frac{d(x)}{d(y)}$$

*for all  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  and  $x, y \in X$ .*

# Binary diagonals

A matrix is said to have a *binary diagonal* if its diagonal entries all come from the set  $\{0, 1\}$ . Furthermore, a matrix is *binary* if its entries come from the set  $\{0, 1\}$ .

Theorem (Livshits, MacDonald, Radjavi)

*Every indecomposable semigroup of nonnegative matrices with binary diagonals is up to a similarity a semigroup of binary matrices. Moreover, the similarity can be implemented by an invertible, positive, diagonal matrix.*



# Binary diagonals

A matrix is said to have a *binary diagonal* if its diagonal entries all come from the set  $\{0, 1\}$ . Furthermore, a matrix is *binary* if its entries come from the set  $\{0, 1\}$ .

## Theorem (Livshits, MacDonald, Radjavi)

*Every indecomposable semigroup of nonnegative matrices with binary diagonals is up to a similarity a semigroup of binary matrices. Moreover, the similarity can be implemented by an invertible, positive, diagonal matrix.*

A nonnegative function  $f$  on  $X \times X$  is said to have a *binary diagonal* if  $f(x, x) \in \{0, 1\}$  for all  $x \in X$ .

### Theorem

Let  $\mathcal{S}$  be an indecomposable semigroup of functions from  $X \times X$  to  $[0, \infty)$ , where the multiplication of  $f$  and  $g$  in  $\mathcal{S}$  is defined by

$$(f * g)(x, y) = \sum_{z \in X} f(x, z)g(z, y).$$

(Here the finiteness of the sum of nonnegative numbers is part of the hypothesis.) If every function  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  has a binary diagonal, then there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto (0, \infty)$  such that

$$\frac{f(x, y)d(y)}{d(x)} \in \{0, 1\}$$

for all  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  and all  $x, y \in X$ .

A nonnegative function  $f$  on  $X \times X$  is said to have a *binary diagonal* if  $f(x, x) \in \{0, 1\}$  for all  $x \in X$ .

## Theorem

Let  $\mathcal{S}$  be an indecomposable semigroup of functions from  $X \times X$  to  $[0, \infty)$ , where the multiplication of  $f$  and  $g$  in  $\mathcal{S}$  is defined by

$$(f * g)(x, y) = \sum_{z \in X} f(x, z)g(z, y).$$

(Here the finiteness of the sum of nonnegative numbers is part of the hypothesis.) If every function  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  has a binary diagonal, then there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto (0, \infty)$  such that

$$\frac{f(x, y)d(y)}{d(x)} \in \{0, 1\}$$

for all  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  and all  $x, y \in X$ .

A nonnegative function  $f$  on  $X \times X$  is said to have a *binary diagonal* if  $f(x, x) \in \{0, 1\}$  for all  $x \in X$ .

## Theorem

Let  $\mathcal{S}$  be an indecomposable semigroup of functions from  $X \times X$  to  $[0, \infty)$ , where the multiplication of  $f$  and  $g$  in  $\mathcal{S}$  is defined by

$$(f * g)(x, y) = \sum_{z \in X} f(x, z)g(z, y).$$

(Here the finiteness of the sum of nonnegative numbers is part of the hypothesis.) If every function  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  has a binary diagonal, then there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto (0, \infty)$  such that

$$\frac{f(x, y)d(y)}{d(x)} \in \{0, 1\}$$

for all  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  and all  $x, y \in X$ .

# Sketch of the proof:

Clearly, we may assume that  $\mathcal{S}$  is maximal with respect to the inclusion. Then  $\mathcal{S}$  contains the characteristic function of the diagonal of  $X \times X$ , which of course acts as an identity with respect to  $*$ .

Step 1:  $\mathcal{S}$  contains the characteristic function of  $\{(u, u)\}$  for each  $u \in X$ .

By Theorem above, there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto (0, \infty)$  such that

$$f(x, y) \leq \frac{d(x)}{d(y)}$$

for all  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  and  $x, y \in X$ .

Step 2:  $f(x, y) = \frac{d(x)}{d(y)}$  provided  $f(x, y) > 0$ .

# Sketch of the proof:

Clearly, we may assume that  $\mathcal{S}$  is maximal with respect to the inclusion. Then  $\mathcal{S}$  contains the characteristic function of the diagonal of  $X \times X$ , which of course acts as an identity with respect to  $*$ .

Step 1:  $\mathcal{S}$  contains the characteristic function of  $\{(u, u)\}$  for each  $u \in X$ .

By Theorem above, there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto (0, \infty)$  such that

$$f(x, y) \leq \frac{d(x)}{d(y)}$$

for all  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  and  $x, y \in X$ .

Step 2:  $f(x, y) = \frac{d(x)}{d(y)}$  provided  $f(x, y) > 0$ .

# Sketch of the proof:

Clearly, we may assume that  $\mathcal{S}$  is maximal with respect to the inclusion. Then  $\mathcal{S}$  contains the characteristic function of the diagonal of  $X \times X$ , which of course acts as an identity with respect to  $*$ .

Step 1:  $\mathcal{S}$  contains the characteristic function of  $\{(u, u)\}$  for each  $u \in X$ .

By Theorem above, there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto (0, \infty)$  such that

$$f(x, y) \leq \frac{d(x)}{d(y)}$$

for all  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  and  $x, y \in X$ .

Step 2:  $f(x, y) = \frac{d(x)}{d(y)}$  provided  $f(x, y) > 0$ .

# Sketch of the proof:

Clearly, we may assume that  $\mathcal{S}$  is maximal with respect to the inclusion. Then  $\mathcal{S}$  contains the characteristic function of the diagonal of  $X \times X$ , which of course acts as an identity with respect to  $*$ .

Step 1:  $\mathcal{S}$  contains the characteristic function of  $\{(u, u)\}$  for each  $u \in X$ .

By Theorem above, there exists a function  $d : X \mapsto (0, \infty)$  such that

$$f(x, y) \leq \frac{d(x)}{d(y)}$$

for all  $f \in \mathcal{S}$  and  $x, y \in X$ .

Step 2:  $f(x, y) = \frac{d(x)}{d(y)}$  provided  $f(x, y) > 0$ .



# Finite diagonals and finite traces

A set  $\mathcal{S}$  of complex matrices is said to have *finite diagonals* if all the diagonal entries of all the matrices in  $\mathcal{S}$  come from a finite set, and it is called *self-adjoint* if for each  $T \in \mathcal{S}$  we have  $T^* \in \mathcal{S}$ . Here  $T^*$  is just the conjugate transpose of  $T$ .

Theorem (Popov, Radjavi, Williamson)

*Suppose that a semigroup  $\mathcal{S}$  of nonnegative matrices has finite diagonals. If  $\mathcal{S}$  is self-adjoint, then it is finite. Moreover, nonzero entries of matrices in  $\mathcal{S}$  are of the form  $\sqrt{\xi\eta}$ , where  $\xi$  and  $\eta$  are diagonal values of some matrices in  $\mathcal{S}$ .*

# Finite diagonals and finite traces

A set  $\mathcal{S}$  of complex matrices is said to have *finite diagonals* if all the diagonal entries of all the matrices in  $\mathcal{S}$  come from a finite set, and it is called *self-adjoint* if for each  $T \in \mathcal{S}$  we have  $T^* \in \mathcal{S}$ . Here  $T^*$  is just the conjugate transpose of  $T$ .

## Theorem (Popov, Radjavi, Williamson)

*Suppose that a semigroup  $\mathcal{S}$  of nonnegative matrices has finite diagonals. If  $\mathcal{S}$  is self-adjoint, then it is finite. Moreover, nonzero entries of matrices in  $\mathcal{S}$  are of the form  $\sqrt{\xi\eta}$ , where  $\xi$  and  $\eta$  are diagonal values of some matrices in  $\mathcal{S}$ .*

For a set  $\mathcal{S}$  of operators on the Hilbert space  $\ell^2$ , we denote by  $\mathcal{S}_+$  the set of all positive semidefinite operators in  $\mathcal{S}$ .

### Theorem

*Let  $\mathcal{S}$  be a self-adjoint semigroup of positive operators on the Banach lattice  $\ell^2$ . Suppose that either:*

- (i)  $\mathcal{S}$  consists of trace-class operators and the set  $\{\operatorname{tr} S : S \in \mathcal{S}_+\}$  is finite, or*
- (ii) for each  $i \in \mathbb{N}$  the set  $\{S_{ii} : S \in \mathcal{S}_+\}$  is finite.*

*Then the nonzero entries of  $S \in \mathcal{S}$  are of the form  $\sqrt{\xi\eta}$ , where  $\xi$  and  $\eta$  are the diagonal entries of the projections  $SS^*$  and  $S^*S$ , respectively.*

For a set  $\mathcal{S}$  of operators on the Hilbert space  $\ell^2$ , we denote by  $\mathcal{S}_+$  the set of all positive semidefinite operators in  $\mathcal{S}$ .

### Theorem

*Let  $\mathcal{S}$  be a self-adjoint semigroup of positive operators on the Banach lattice  $\ell^2$ . Suppose that either:*

- (i)  $\mathcal{S}$  consists of trace-class operators and the set  $\{\operatorname{tr} S : S \in \mathcal{S}_+\}$  is finite, or*
- (ii) for each  $i \in \mathbb{N}$  the set  $\{S_{ii} : S \in \mathcal{S}_+\}$  is finite.*

*Then the nonzero entries of  $S \in \mathcal{S}$  are of the form  $\sqrt{\xi\eta}$ , where  $\xi$  and  $\eta$  are the diagonal entries of the projections  $SS^*$  and  $S^*S$ , respectively.*

For a set  $\mathcal{S}$  of operators on the Hilbert space  $\ell^2$ , we denote by  $\mathcal{S}_+$  the set of all positive semidefinite operators in  $\mathcal{S}$ .

## Theorem

*Let  $\mathcal{S}$  be a self-adjoint semigroup of positive operators on the Banach lattice  $\ell^2$ . Suppose that either:*

- (i)  $\mathcal{S}$  consists of trace-class operators and the set  $\{\operatorname{tr} S : S \in \mathcal{S}_+\}$  is finite, or*
- (ii) for each  $i \in \mathbb{N}$  the set  $\{S_{ii} : S \in \mathcal{S}_+\}$  is finite.*

*Then the nonzero entries of  $S \in \mathcal{S}$  are of the form  $\sqrt{\xi\eta}$ , where  $\xi$  and  $\eta$  are the diagonal entries of the projections  $SS^*$  and  $S^*S$ , respectively.*

For a set  $\mathcal{S}$  of operators on the Hilbert space  $\ell^2$ , we denote by  $\mathcal{S}_+$  the set of all positive semidefinite operators in  $\mathcal{S}$ .

### Theorem

*Let  $\mathcal{S}$  be a self-adjoint semigroup of positive operators on the Banach lattice  $\ell^2$ . Suppose that either:*

- (i)  $\mathcal{S}$  consists of trace-class operators and the set  $\{\operatorname{tr} S : S \in \mathcal{S}_+\}$  is finite, or*
- (ii) for each  $i \in \mathbb{N}$  the set  $\{S_{ii} : S \in \mathcal{S}_+\}$  is finite.*

*Then the nonzero entries of  $S \in \mathcal{S}$  are of the form  $\sqrt{\xi\eta}$ , where  $\xi$  and  $\eta$  are the diagonal entries of the projections  $SS^*$  and  $S^*S$ , respectively.*

## Theorem

*Let  $\mathcal{S}$  be a self-adjoint semigroup of nonnegative matrices such that the set  $\{\text{tr } S : S \in \mathcal{S}_+\}$  is finite. Then nonzero entries of matrices in  $\mathcal{S}$  are of the form  $\sqrt{\xi\eta}$ , where  $\xi$  and  $\eta$  are diagonal values of some projections in  $\mathcal{S}$ . Furthermore,  $\mathcal{S}$  is finite.*

## Theorem

*Let  $\mathcal{S}$  be a self-adjoint semigroup of nonnegative matrices such that the set  $\{\text{tr } S : S \in \mathcal{S}_+\}$  is finite. Then nonzero entries of matrices in  $\mathcal{S}$  are of the form  $\sqrt{\xi\eta}$ , where  $\xi$  and  $\eta$  are diagonal values of some projections in  $\mathcal{S}$ . Furthermore,  $\mathcal{S}$  is finite.*



Condition (i) of Theorem above does not imply condition (ii).

Let  $c = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}$  and  $f = (c, c^2, c^3, \dots) \in l^2$ . Then  $\|f\| = 1$ . For a positive integer  $m$ , let  $g_m$  denote the vector obtained from  $f$  by annihilating alternate segments of length  $2^m$ , i.e.,

$$g_m = (\underbrace{c, c^2, \dots, c^{2^m}}_{2^m}, \underbrace{0, \dots, 0}_{2^m}, \underbrace{c^{2^{m+1}+1}, c^{2^{m+1}+2}, \dots, c^{3 \cdot 2^m}}_{2^m}, \underbrace{0, \dots, 0}_{2^m}, \dots),$$

and let  $h_m = f - g_m$ . Then the operator

$$Q_m = \frac{g_m g_m^*}{\|g_m\|^2} + \frac{h_m h_m^*}{\|h_m\|^2}$$

is a projection on  $l^2$  of rank two. Define also the rank-one projection  $P = f f^*$ . Then the set

$$\mathcal{S} = \{P, Q_1, Q_2, Q_3, \dots\}$$

is a semigroup, and, for each  $i$ , the set of all  $(i, i)$  slots of members in  $\mathcal{S}_+ = \mathcal{S}$  is infinite.

Condition (i) of Theorem above does not imply condition (ii).

Let  $c = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}$  and  $f = (c, c^2, c^3, \dots) \in \ell^2$ . Then  $\|f\| = 1$ . For a positive integer  $m$ , let  $g_m$  denote the vector obtained from  $f$  by annihilating alternate segments of length  $2^m$ , i.e.,

$$g_m = (\underbrace{c, c^2, \dots, c^{2^m}}_{2^m}, \underbrace{0, \dots, 0}_{2^m}, \underbrace{c^{2^{m+1}+1}, c^{2^{m+1}+2}, \dots, c^{3 \cdot 2^m}}_{2^m}, \underbrace{0, \dots, 0}_{2^m}, \dots),$$

and let  $h_m = f - g_m$ . Then the operator

$$Q_m = \frac{g_m g_m^*}{\|g_m\|^2} + \frac{h_m h_m^*}{\|h_m\|^2}$$

is a projection on  $\ell^2$  of rank two. Define also the rank-one projection  $P = f f^*$ . Then the set

$$\mathcal{S} = \{P, Q_1, Q_2, Q_3, \dots\}$$

is a semigroup, and, for each  $i$ , the set of all  $(i, i)$  slots of members in  $\mathcal{S}_+ = \mathcal{S}$  is infinite.

Condition (i) of Theorem above does not imply condition (ii).

Let  $c = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}$  and  $f = (c, c^2, c^3, \dots) \in \ell^2$ . Then  $\|f\| = 1$ . For a positive integer  $m$ , let  $g_m$  denote the vector obtained from  $f$  by annihilating alternate segments of length  $2^m$ , i.e.,

$$g_m = (\underbrace{c, c^2, \dots, c^{2^m}}_{2^m}, \underbrace{0, \dots, 0}_{2^m}, \underbrace{c^{2^{m+1}+1}, c^{2^{m+1}+2}, \dots, c^{3 \cdot 2^m}}_{2^m}, \underbrace{0, \dots, 0}_{2^m}, \dots),$$

and let  $h_m = f - g_m$ . Then the operator

$$Q_m = \frac{g_m g_m^*}{\|g_m\|^2} + \frac{h_m h_m^*}{\|h_m\|^2}$$

is a projection on  $\ell^2$  of rank two. Define also the rank-one projection  $P = f f^*$ . Then the set

$$\mathcal{S} = \{P, Q_1, Q_2, Q_3, \dots\}$$

is a semigroup, and, for each  $i$ , the set of all  $(i, i)$  slots of members in  $\mathcal{S}_+ = \mathcal{S}$  is infinite.

Condition (i) of Theorem above does not imply condition (ii).

Let  $c = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}$  and  $f = (c, c^2, c^3, \dots) \in \ell^2$ . Then  $\|f\| = 1$ . For a positive integer  $m$ , let  $g_m$  denote the vector obtained from  $f$  by annihilating alternate segments of length  $2^m$ , i.e.,

$$g_m = (\underbrace{c, c^2, \dots, c^{2^m}}_{2^m}, \underbrace{0, \dots, 0}_{2^m}, \underbrace{c^{2^{m+1}+1}, c^{2^{m+1}+2}, \dots, c^{3 \cdot 2^m}}_{2^m}, \underbrace{0, \dots, 0}_{2^m}, \dots),$$

and let  $h_m = f - g_m$ . Then the operator

$$Q_m = \frac{g_m g_m^*}{\|g_m\|^2} + \frac{h_m h_m^*}{\|h_m\|^2}$$

is a projection on  $\ell^2$  of rank two. Define also the rank-one projection  $P = f f^*$ . Then the set

$$\mathcal{S} = \{P, Q_1, Q_2, Q_3, \dots\}$$

is a semigroup, and, for each  $i$ , the set of all  $(i, i)$  slots of members in  $\mathcal{S}_+ = \mathcal{S}$  is infinite.

# Bibliography

- ① R. Drnovšek, H. Radjavi, *On semigroups of nonnegative functions and positive operators*, J. Math. Anal. Appl. 404 (2013), no. 1, 29–35.
- ② H. Gessesse, A.I. Popov, H. Radjavi, E. Spinu, A. Tcaciuc, V. G. Troitsky, *Bounded indecomposable semigroups of non-negative matrices*, Positivity 14 (2010), no. 3, 383–394.
- ③ L. Livshits, G. MacDonald, H. Radjavi, *Positive matrix semigroups with binary diagonals*, Positivity 15 (2011), no. 3, 411–440.
- ④ A. I. Popov, H. Radjavi, P. Williamson, *Nonnegative matrix semigroups with finite diagonals*, Linear Algebra and its Applications 434 (2011), no. 6, 1409–1424.